Income Growth: The Taxman Cometh

The following report is an update to the previously released report of the same title. Changes to the BLS methodology skewed the after-tax data. These changes and their implications are discussed below.

Lackluster Income Growth

In our previous report, we first discussed the lack of before-tax income growth since the end of the recession. This story remains true, as the data in the top chart have not been affected by the methodology changes implemented by the BLS in 2013, which we discuss later. However, the BLS data tells a slightly different story than the BEA personal income data, which shows income dropping in January 2013 but recovering these losses afterwards (bottom chart). This drop was likely a result of companies ramping up dividend and bonus payments ahead of the tax policy changes on January 1, 2013. Among these changes were the expiration of the Bush-era 2 percent payroll tax cut for all workers, increased capital gains taxes and a tax hike on the highest income earners.

In 2013, the BLS changed their methodology in their consumer expenditure survey (CEX), the source of data for our original report. While in previous years the BLS used survey responses to calculate tax burdens, in 2013 they started using Census tax software to calculate tax burdens more precisely. The previous methodology was subject to large errors because non-respondents were recorded as zeroes. This likely underestimated the actual tax burden of respondents. Thus, the new methodology, while more accurate, overestimates the change in after-tax income from 2012 to 2013.

Although the original BLS data we used overestimated the effects of tax policy on income growth, we can use BEA personal income data to compare the tax situation in this cycle to the previous one. In the previous recovery, President Bush enacted broad-based tax cuts, including specific tax cuts for the highest income earners, whose effects can be seen in the middle chart. Nominal disposable income, or nominal personal income less current taxes, increased by roughly the same amount as nominal pre-tax income over the course of the five years following the end of the 2001 recession. Conversely, growth in disposable income in the five years following the most recent recession is lagging roughly 3.5 percentage points behind pre-tax income growth, which itself has been growing slowly relative to the previous cycle. The divergence in growth between before and after-tax income has been exacerbated since the aforementioned Bush-era tax cuts expired. The effects of the tax policy can clearly be seen in the bottom chart, as before and after-tax income spiked and then sharply declined at the start of 2013. However, disposable income has still grown roughly 10 percent since the end of the recession, contrary to the negative growth our prior data had suggested. Thus, while changes in tax policy seem to indeed have had an impact on the income picture in the United States, it seems as though the data we previously used overestimated the effects of these changes. We unfortunately do not have access to other data on after-tax income by quintile, so we cannot make the same comparisons across income levels that we did in our original report.

Source: U.S. Department of Labor, U.S. Department of Commerce and Wells Fargo Securities, LLC
Diane Schumaker-Krieg  
Global Head of Research, Economics & Strategy  
(704) 410-1801  
diane.schumaker@wellsfargo.com

John E. Silvia, Ph.D.  
Chief Economist  
(704) 410-3275  
john.silvia@wellsfargo.com

Mark Vitner  
Senior Economist  
(704) 410-3277  
mark.vitner@wellsfargo.com

Jay H. Bryson, Ph.D.  
Global Economist  
(704) 410-3274  
jay.bryson@wellsfargo.com

Sam Bullard  
Senior Economist  
(704) 410-3280  
sam.bullard@wellsfargo.com

Nick Bennenbroek  
Currency Strategist  
(212) 214-5636  
nicholas.bennenbroek@wellsfargo.com

Eugenio J. Alemán, Ph.D.  
Senior Economist  
(704) 410-3273  
eugenio.j.aleman@wellsfargo.com

Anika R. Khan  
Senior Economist  
(704) 410-3271  
anika.khan@wellsfargo.com

Azhar Iqbal  
Econometrician  
(704) 410-3270  
azhar.iqbal@wellsfargo.com

Tim Quinlan  
Economist  
(704) 410-3283  
tim.quinlan@wellsfargo.com

Eric Viloria, CFA  
Currency Strategist  
(212) 214-5637  
eric.viloria@wellsfargo.com

Sarah Watt House  
Economist  
(704) 410-3282  
sarah.house@wellsfargo.com

Michael A. Brown  
Economist  
(704) 410-3278  
michael.a.brown@wellsfargo.com

Michael T. Wolf  
Economist  
(704) 410-3286  
michael.t.wolf@wellsfargo.com

Zachary Griffiths  
Economic Analyst  
(704) 410-3284  
zachary.griffiths@wellsfargo.com

Mackenzie Miller  
Economic Analyst  
(704) 410-3358  
mackenzie.miller@wellsfargo.com

Erik Nelson  
Economic Analyst  
(704) 410-3267  
erik.f.nelson@wellsfargo.com

Alex Moehring  
Economic Analyst  
(704) 410-3247  
alex.v.moehring@wellsfargo.com

Donna LaFleur  
Executive Assistant  
(704) 410-3279  
donna.lafleur@wellsfargo.com

Cyndi Burris  
Senior Admin. Assistant  
(704) 410-3272  
cyndi.burris@wellsfargo.com

Wells Fargo Securities Economics Group publications are produced by Wells Fargo Securities, LLC, a U.S broker-dealer registered with the U.S. Securities and Exchange Commission, the Financial Industry Regulatory Authority, and the Securities Investor Protection Corp. Wells Fargo Securities, LLC, distributes these publications directly and through subsidiaries including, but not limited to, Wells Fargo & Company, Wells Fargo Bank N.A., Wells Fargo Advisors, LLC, Wells Fargo Securities International Limited, Wells Fargo Securities Asia Limited and Wells Fargo Securities (Japan) Co. Limited. Wells Fargo Securities, LLC (“WFS”) is registered with the Commodities Futures Trading Commission as a futures commission merchant and is a member in good standing of the National Futures Association. Wells Fargo Bank, N.A. (“WFBNA”) is registered with the Commodities Futures Trading Commission as a swap dealer and is a member in good standing of the National Futures Association. WFS and WFBNA are generally engaged in the trading of futures and derivative products, any of which may be discussed within this publication. Wells Fargo Securities, LLC does not compensate its research analysts based on specific investment banking transactions. Wells Fargo Securities, LLC's research analysts receive compensation that is based upon and impacted by the overall profitability and revenue of the firm which includes, but is not limited to investment banking revenue. The information and opinions herein are for general information use only. Wells Fargo Securities, LLC does not guarantee their accuracy or completeness, nor does Wells Fargo Securities, LLC assume any liability for any loss that may result from the reliance by any person upon any such information or opinions. Such information and opinions are subject to change without notice, are for general information only and are not intended as an offer or solicitation with respect to the purchase or sales of any security or as personalized investment advice. Wells Fargo Securities, LLC is a separate legal entity and distinct from affiliated banks and is a wholly owned subsidiary of Wells Fargo & Company © 2014 Wells Fargo Securities, LLC.

Important Information for Non-U.S. Recipients

For recipients in the EEA, this report is distributed by Wells Fargo Securities International Limited (“WFSIL”). WFSIL is a U.K. incorporated investment firm authorized and regulated by the Financial Conduct Authority. The content of this report has been approved by WFSIL a regulated person under the Act. For purposes of the U.K. Financial Conduct Authority’s rules, this report constitutes impartial investment research. WFSIL does not deal with retail clients as defined in the Markets in Financial Instruments Directive 2007. The FCA rules made under the Financial Services and Markets Act 2000 for the protection of retail clients will therefore not apply, nor will the Financial Services Compensation Scheme be available. This report is not intended for, and should not be relied upon by, retail clients. This document and any other materials accompanying this document (collectively, the "Materials") are provided for general informational purposes only.

SEcurities: NOT FDIC-INSURED/NOT BANK-GUARANTEED/MAY LOSE VALUE